

# Annex-I TERMS OF REFERENCE FOR INSTITUTIONAL CONTRACT



## 1. Title of the assignment:

Base line and end line study for the Rural and Remote Education Initiative for Papua provinces – Phase 3

## 2. Background and Justification:

The Government of Indonesia (GoI) has made impressive progress towards universal education over the past few decades, particularly at primary education level, in which the country is close to achieving universal access. Despite this progress, Indonesia continues to lag behind in terms of learning outcomes and is facing a 'learning crisis', with multiple dimensions, as reflected in large proportions of children and youth lacking the foundational literacy and numeracy skills, as well as the transferrable skills needed for life and work in the 21st century. National and international student learning assessments alike have revealed low achievement among Indonesian children in literacy, mathematics and science. At the primary education level, the Indonesian National Assessment Program (INAP) in 2016 showed that only 53 per cent of children in grade 4 reached the minimum proficiency in reading, 23 per cent in mathematics and 26 per cent in science.

These results are concerning, as research and experience shows low performance in reading is a strong predictor and determinant of performance in other subject areas. Therefore, based on this evidence, addressing the learning crisis needs to begin with improving children's basic literacy skills from the very beginning of their schooling.

Other dimensions of this learning crisis relate to socio-economic status, geographic location and gender. The results of the 2018 Program for International Student Assessment (PISA), which measures 15-year old's reading, mathematics and science proficiencies, showed students with the highest socioeconomic status (SES) are 2.6 times more likely to achieve minimum proficiency in reading than those with the lowest SES. Furthermore, the 2016 INAP results reveal significant geographic disparities, with children in the eastern regions of Indonesia, such as Papua, Maluku, Sulawesi and Nusa Tenggara, consistently performing lower than the national average across all subjects.

Against this backdrop, UNICEF has been providing technical support to schools, districts and provinces since 2010 to improve the quality of education in the most disadvantaged regions, with particular attention to Papua and West Papua. This work has been undertaken in three phases and delivered through a longstanding partnership with Australia's aid programme. Under phase 2 of the programme, from 2015, the Early Grade Literacy (EGL) approach was introduced and piloted as a concrete program to improve reading in primary schools in Papua and West Papua. An early grade literacy baseline study, also conducted in 2015, assessed reading proficiencies of grade 2 and 3 students in rural and remote schools in these provinces. Concerningly, over 50 per cent of grade 2 and 3 students were classified as non-readers and only 12 per cent classified as reading fluently with comprehension. In remote rural schools in Papua, the percentage of non-readers was alarmingly much higher, at 62 per cent.

### 2.1 Rural and Remote Education Initiative for Papua provinces Phase 3

The current phase (phase 3) of the Rural and Remote Education Initiative for Papua provinces, which began implementation on from late September 2021,<sup>1</sup> is funded by Australia, through the Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT). **The overall goal of the programme is to improve children's learning outcomes in Papua and West Papua provinces.**

To achieve this goal, this phase of the programme was designed around three key pillars, each addressing selected constraints that negatively impact on the education of children living in rural and remote areas of Papua and West Papua. Through these three pillars, quality and increased quantity of teaching and learning materials are being provided, as well as professional training, coaching and technical assistance to improve the quality of basic

<sup>1</sup> DFAT provided final approval of the Rural and Remote Education Initiative for Papua province's Implementation Plan on 27 September 2021.

education services, with a specific emphasis on improving early grade learning outcomes of students in grades 1, 2 and 3. The focus areas under the three pillars are described below.

*Pillar 1: School level strengthening*

The focus of school level activities under Pillar 1 is threefold. Firstly, demonstrating to local governments through working in a limited number of schools how improving the quality of teaching of foundational skills (literacy and numeracy) can have a positive impact on student learning outcomes as well as other benefits, and show how this can be achieved with limited resources that are available locally. Secondly, providing interventions that target children experiencing extreme vulnerabilities where the capacity of local government to provide quality education for these children is low. Thirdly, extending the reach and impact of the program through 'value added' activities, including digitalisation of teaching and learning materials for early grades for use in the Papua context.

*Pillar 2: District level system strengthening*

Pillar 2 is the core component related to scaling-up and longer-term sustainability, as it focuses on providing technical support to local governments to enable them to effectively promote the attainment of foundational skills, including literacy and numeracy, within their districts, as well as linking them with national and provincial level government initiatives that will support this process. Activities under Pillar 2 include support for inclusion of foundational teaching and learning skills related to literacy and numeracy in district level planning and budgeting.

*Pillar 3: Evidence Generation*

Pillar 3 is comprised of three key activities that are focused on providing evidence to support the implementation of the other two pillars. These three activities include assessment of the impact of improving early grades literacy and numeracy quality; developing a roadmap for scaling up; and identifying ways in which a significant barrier to wider implementation of foundational literacy and numeracy skills – teacher absenteeism – can be addressed.

UNICEF is therefore seeking the services of a credible local institution to conduct the baseline study under phase 3 of this programme.

### **3. Purpose and objectives of the assignment**

The purpose of this assignment is to establish robust base line and end line data on early grade learning, so the impact of the current phase of the Rural and Remote Education Initiative on children's learning outcomes can be comprehensively measured and well understood.

Specific objectives include:

- To establish base line data for interventions in six districts of Papua and West Papua, using key indicators as outlined in the programme's monitoring and evaluation framework.
- To collect and comprehensively analyse end line data using the same key indicators used in base line data collection to enable the programme impact to be comprehensively understood.
- To collect and analyse data not only directly related to learning outcomes, but data that indicates results in other domains, namely the quality of education, school management, parental value for education and education authorities' capacity to adopt, plan and budget for investments in improving early grade learning.
- To assess the existing capacity of district authorities to scale up the Early Grade Literacy Programming using shared resources

### **4. Methodology:**

The base line and end line study is the cornerstone of the programme research and evaluation framework, and it will provide critical evidence from which to assess the degree to which the programme achieved in key objectives and overall goal.

The study will include a mixture of quantitative and qualitative methodologies to provide robust evidence of the programme's impact. Specific data collection methodologies may include, but may not be limited to, the use of household surveys, focus groups, key informant interviews and observations. Quantitative data collection methods will need to draw upon school records in key indicators, such as enrolment and attendance and learning outcomes, including the measurement of basic reading and mathematics proficiencies. Other school-related quantitative data may include student retention and completion. The Early Grade Reading Assessment (EGRA) instrument used for the previous programme phase will be used for this study;<sup>2</sup> as well as a more recently prepared Early Grade Mathematics Assessment (EGMA) instrument. In addition to the EGRA and EGMA, a set of qualitative data collection instruments will be jointly developed between UNICEF and the contracting institution, that should assess community's, parent's, and government's perspectives on foundational skills, including government capacity and commitment to scale up the programme in the future.

Data collected through base line and end line processes will be representative of the target groups. Given this requirement, data is expected to be collected at school and community levels, sub-district, district and provincial levels, where available and relevant to programme objectives and to the types of interventions planned. **Sex-disaggregated and disability disaggregated data will need to be collected amongst target groups, as appropriate.**

Data collected through base line and end line processes will be relevant to factors that could affect the programme's capacity to deliver its outcome, such as identification of specific barriers to education faced by children and their communities in target areas; as well as by districts in prioritising early grade learning within their planning and budgeting processes to support replication in schools.

The base line and end line will be designed by the contractor in close collaboration with UNICEF Indonesia's education team and other programme partners. In preparing the methodology for this work, the contractor will need to build in a degree of flexibility into the data collection process, with provision made for both the remote collection of data and for in-field data collection – depending on the situation with the COVID19 pandemic at the time, and associated travel-related restrictions.

#### **4.1 Geographic focus and sampling**

The base line and end line will be conducted in six districts: Paniai, Yahukimo, Mamberamo Raya, Kaimana, Raja Ampat and Sorong Selatan, located across Papua and West Papua provinces, where the programme is being implemented. Refer to the table below for further information about these districts.

Province	District	#Population (Papua/West Papua Statistics Bureau, 2020)	# of Primary Schools (Papua/West Papua Statistics Bureau, 2019)
Papua	Paniai	180,502	83
	Yahukimo	192,627	163
	Mamberamo Raya	24,733	75
West Papua	Kaimana	62,256	85
	Raja Ampat	64,141	102
	Sorong Selatan	52,469	83

Overall, approximately 120 schools (may include Madrasahs **and private Christian schools**, but in few numbers) across the six districts are expected to be sampled as part of this study (treatment group). The actual number/percentage of schools sampled per district should be proportional. The schools will be selected together with UNICEF and districts' implementing partners and will be contacted in close coordination with local authorities. Another set of schools would be selected as control group, with numbers and criteria to be identified based on the selected methodologies.

The contractor will be required to develop a sampling framework to confirm data collection arrangements for the base line and end line. In preparing the sampling framework, consideration should be given to sample size selection in each district with respect to reaching robust and credible findings. For child respondents, only students from Grade 2 and 3 primary schools will be involved in the study.

<sup>2</sup> Preferably the same EGRA instruments used in the previous phase of the EGL programme.

The base line and end line study cohort will be the same, including children in households located in areas where the programme is implemented and households where the programme is not being implemented (control areas). By comparing the changes in outcomes in treatment and control areas at two different points in time (base line and end line), this will enable identification of attributable changes in outcomes due to programme interventions.

Both the baseline and the endline study may take place during COVID-19 pandemic. While the studies will be done offline/face-to-face, as it can be challenging to conduct online discussions in rural and remote settings, in circumstances where offline discussions were deemed impossible, approaches with limited number of respondents and key informant interviews will be used with strict health protocols.

#### **5. Timing/duration of contract:**

The base line and end line study is to be conducted at two distinct intervals over a 22-month period from 1 March 2022 to 31 December 2023.

## 6. Deliverable and payment schedule

The table below provides a summary of the expected deliverables, key tasks to be undertaken to realize these deliverables, expected number of input days for each deliverable and key deliverable deadlines.

**Table 1 Expected deliverables**

Deliverables	Tasks	Indicative input days	Due date
<b>Baseline deliverables</b>			
<b>Deliverable #1:</b> Draft inception report, approximately 10 pages, excluding annexes.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Conduct a desk review of relevant literature and consultations with the UNICEF education team to confirm the study scope.</li> <li>- Develop a draft inception report including literature review, methodology and sampling framework, detailed implementation plan covering both the base line and end line data collection processes and related analysis, proposed data collection instruments (in English and Bahasa Indonesia), and tabulation data plans.</li> <li>- Obtain ethical clearance for the study</li> </ul>	10 days	14 March 2022
<b>Deliverable #2:</b> Final inception report, approximately 10 pages, excluding annexes.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Incorporate feedback from UNICEF's education team on the draft inception report and prepare a final inception report</li> </ul>	3 days	28 March 2022
<b>Deliverable #3:</b> Enumerator training report, approximately 5 pages, excluding annexes.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Recruitment and training of enumerators to conduct the base line, in collaboration with UNICEF's education team</li> </ul>	7 days	8 April 2022
<b>Deliverable #4:</b> Draft base line report, approximately 15 pages excluding annexes.  Draft PowerPoint presentation of approximately 15 slides.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Conduct data collection according to agreed methodology using the team of enumerators and carefully analyse the data.</li> <li>- Prepare the draft baseline report in English containing robust analysis of data collected (including clear and logical infographics) and recommendations for programme quality improvement</li> <li>- Prepare a draft PowerPoint presentation, summarizing the key base line findings and recommendations and present this to UNICEF's education team and other partners, as advised by UNICEF</li> </ul>	21 days	9 May 2022
<b>Deliverable #5:</b> Final base line report, approximately 20 pages, excluding annexes.  A final PowerPoint presentation of approximately 15 slides.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The final base line report should be prepared based on UNICEF's reporting standards and incorporate feedback received from UNICEF on the draft report.</li> <li>- Finalise the PowerPoint presentation, summarizing the key baseline findings and recommendations, based on</li> </ul>	10 days	24 May 2022

Raw data files and all tabulations (in agreed format)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>consolidated feedback provided by UNICEF.</li> <li>- Produce English and Bahasa Indonesia versions of the PowerPoint presentation; and present this during a meeting with key partners.</li> <li>- Prepare raw data files and all tabulations in accordance with the format agreed by UNICEF.</li> </ul>		
<b>End line deliverables</b>			
<b>Deliverable #6:</b> End line work plan, approximately 5 pages, excluding annexes.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Prepare a detailed work plan for the end line part of the study, updating the methodology, sampling framework and data collection instruments (in English and Bahasa Indonesia) and tabulation data plans, as needed.</li> </ul>	3 days	4 October 2023
<b>Deliverable #7: Enumerator training report</b> , approximately 5 pages, excluding annexes.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Recruitment and training of enumerators to conduct the end line, in collaboration with UNICEF's education team.</li> </ul>	7 days	13 October 2023
<b>Deliverable #8:</b> Draft end line report, approximately 15 pages excluding annexes.  Draft PowerPoint presentation of approximately 15 slides.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Conduct data collection according to agreed methodology using the team of enumerators and carefully analyse the data.</li> <li>- Prepare the draft end line report in English containing robust analysis of data collected (including clear and logical infographics) including comparative analysis with key data collected during the base line. Include recommendations and lessons learned in this report.</li> <li>- Prepare a draft PowerPoint presentation, summarizing the key base line findings (based on comparative analysis against base line data) and include recommendations and lessons learned. Present this to UNICEF's education team and other partners, as advised by UNICEF.</li> </ul>	21 days	13 November 2023
<b>Deliverable #9:</b> Final end line report, approximately 20 pages, excluding annexes.  A final PowerPoint presentation of approximately 15 slides.  Raw data files and all tabulations (in agreed format)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The final base line report should be prepared based on UNICEF's reporting standards; and incorporate feedback received from UNICEF on the draft report.</li> <li>- Finalise the PowerPoint presentation, summarizing the key end line findings and recommendations, based on consolidated feedback provided by UNICEF.</li> <li>- Produce English and Bahasa Indonesia versions of the PowerPoint presentation; and present this during a meeting with key partners.</li> </ul>	10 days	8 December 2023

	- Prepare raw data files and all tabulations in accordance with the format agreed by UNICEF.		
<b>Total indicative input days</b>		<b>92 days</b>	

**Table 2 Payment schedule****Payment**

i) Submission of inception report (Deliverables #1 and #2)	15%
ii) Submission of Enumerator training report, draft baseline report and draft PowerPoint presentation (Deliverables #3 and #4)	30%
iii) Submission of final base line report, PowerPoint presentation and raw data (Deliverable #5)	10%
iv) Submission of End line work plan and enumerator training report (Deliverables #6 and #7)	10%
v) Submission of draft end line report, draft PowerPoint presentation (Deliverable #8)	20%
vi) Submission of final end line report, final PowerPoint presentation and raw data (Deliverable #9)	15%

**Reporting Requirements:**

Reports should be provided in electronic format using standard Windows software, be meet UNICEF standard reporting requirements. Presentation of reports in English and Bahasa Indonesia should be of high quality. Expenses related to the translation of reports are to be covered by the contracted local institution in accordance with the deliverables specified.

**7. Ethical Considerations**

As part of their research protocol, the successful contractor will identify and outline an approach to addressing potential ethical issues in a study involving children. This includes ensuring that all study participants provide informed consent. If participants are under age 18, parents should also provide consent.

Guidance on research ethics can be obtained from the following UN documents:

- UNICEF PROCEDURE FOR ETHICAL STANDARDS IN RESEARCH, EVALUATION, DATA COLLECTION AND ANALYSIS", April 2015 ([http://www.unicef.org/supply/files/ATTACHMENT\\_IV-UNICEF\\_Procedure\\_for\\_Ethical\\_Standards.PDF](http://www.unicef.org/supply/files/ATTACHMENT_IV-UNICEF_Procedure_for_Ethical_Standards.PDF)).
- Ethical guidelines for evaluations: <http://www.unevaluation.org/document/download/548>
- Evaluators' code of conduct: [http://www.unicef.org/evaluation/files/Evaluation\\_Principles\\_UNEG\\_Code\\_of\\_Conduct.pdf](http://www.unicef.org/evaluation/files/Evaluation_Principles_UNEG_Code_of_Conduct.pdf)
- Ethical research involving children: <http://childethics.com/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/ERIC-compendium-approved-digital-web.pdf>
- 
- The consulting institution must also obtain ethical clearance/approval from reliable independent institutions



## 8. Qualifications Required:

The consulting institution must provide details of qualification and a work profile of the institution and the research team members who should meet the following required minimum conditions:

### Institution

- The firm/institution should be nationally registered (in Indonesia under the prevailing law) or have permits to operate in Indonesia.
- The selected institution at least has 8 years' experience in monitoring and evaluation and shall demonstrate proven experience in the use of participatory, qualitative, and quantitative evaluation/analytic methodologies, especially related to emergencies and disaster risk reduction particularly in education sector.
- Have experience conducting gender responsive, ethical, and participatory research studies of good quality for at least 3 years, including use of participatory methodologies.
- The team must be fluent in both written and spoken Bahasa Indonesia and English.

### The Team

The Team Leader and key members of the team should meet the following requirements:

- Relevant post graduate level qualifications (Master or PhD) in monitoring and evaluation or other relevant field (such as education/education assessments).
- Have at least 8 years' experience in research and/or evaluation design: including designing and planning research and evaluation approaches and methodologies, including quantitative and qualitative research methods.
- Have sound and relevant knowledge and experience of evaluation design, including including demonstrated ability to design and plan assessment approaches and research methodologies, including quantitative and qualitative research methods.
- Possess relevant subject matter knowledge and experience, including of the education sector and related gender issues, to ensure the study design and research methods are as relevant and meaningful as possible given the aims and objectives of the project and the context in which it is being delivered;
- Evaluation management experience sufficient to manage a potentially complex evaluation and research process from end-to-end, including conducting and reporting on base line and end line data collection;
- Experience in designing, managing and implementing primary research in challenging project environments, such as fragile and conflict affected states;
- High level proficiency in spoken and written Bahasa Indonesia and English is required within the study team, including excellent writing and verbal presentation skills;
- Demonstrated ability to design and manage data information systems capable of handling large datasets for M&E purposes;
- Proven skills in statistical analysis, including in statistical modelling and analysis of impact data; highly proficient in the use of: SPSS and/or STATA; and qualitative data analysis software e.g. ATLAS.ti, NVivo or equivalent.



### 9. Evaluation Criteria:

CATEGORY	MAX POINT	MIN PASSING POINT
<b>1. ORGANIZATIONAL CAPACITY</b>  <b>1.1</b> Detail of relevant experience and list of clients in the last five years, including contact details (name, email address, and phone numbers that can be used as reference) <b>1.2</b> Financial Statement and Balance Sheet (audited preferably) for the last 3 years.	15	
<b>2. QUALITY OF THE TECHNICAL PROPOSAL</b>  <b>2.1</b> Proposed methodology and approach with reference to objectives in TOR <b>2.2</b> Implementation timeline: identify key tasks and timeline, focal person for each activity/deliverable should be identified. <b>2.3</b> Anticipated project risks and mitigation measures as well as quality assurance	40	
<b>3. KEY PERSONNEL</b>  <b>3.1</b> Names and full CVs of the institution personnel that will be directly involved in the assignment, including (but not limited to) the designated Team Leader/ Project Manager. The list should include at least one senior staff with good experience on assessments related to education, including working at school, district and provincial level stakeholders <b>3.2</b> Adequate and appropriate staff combination in relation to the respective tasks and deliverables (see TOR); and relevant prior experiences of similar scope and complexity.	15	
<b>TOTAL TECHNICAL PROPOSAL</b> *The bidder has to meet this minimum passing point for the Technical Evaluation in order to be considered further for the Financial Evaluation	70	54
<b>PRICE/FINANCIAL PROPOSAL</b> Financial proposals should be all-inclusive, including costs for fees, travel, sub-contracts and other necessary expenses.	30	
<b>TOTAL MARKS</b>	<b>100</b>	

**Note:**

1. The technical evaluation criteria above can be changed to appropriately reflect requirement.
2. The total weight/score of the technical component should be in a range of 50 % - 80%, and the total weight/score of financial criteria in a range of 20% - 50%.
3. Sum of technical and commercial must always equal 100 %

**10. Supervisor:**

The contractor supervisor is Annisa Elok Budiyan, Education Specialist OIC.

**11. Supply Plan Reference**

This assignment is an activity referenced under AWP Output 4.3, activity 4.3.2.6 Baseline and End line studies in areas of intervention. Supply Plan reference: TBC